

Bids and Awards Committee for Consulting Services (BAC-C)

RESOLUTION NO. 2022-006
(Procurement of Consulting Services for the Appraisal of BCDA Properties 2022
under Section 53.6 of the 2016 Revised IRR of RA 9184)

WHEREAS, the Bases Conversion and Development Authority (BCDA) is mandated under Republic Act No. 7227, as amended by Republic Act No. 7917, to accelerate the sound and balanced conversion into alternative productive uses of the Clark and Subic military reservations and their extensions, to raise funds by the sale of portions of Metro Manila Military Camps and to apply said funds for the development and conversion into alternative productive uses of these properties;

WHEREAS, the BCDA, through its Bids and Awards Committee for Consulting Services (BAC-C), published a Request for Proposal (RFP) on 11 August 2022 for the procurement of three (3) independent Consultants under Section 53.6 "Negotiated Procurement - Scientific, Scholarly or Artistic Work, Exclusive Technology and Media Services" of the 2016 Revised Implementing Rules and Regulations (RIRR) of Republic Act No. 9184, each with an Approved Budget for the Contract in the amount of **Pesos: Two Million, Three Hundred Fifty-Five Thousand, Two Hundred Forty-Eight and 00/100 (Php 2,355,248.00)**, inclusive of applicable taxes, fees and incidental expenses;

WHEREAS, in response to the said advertisement of RFP, four (4) bidders submitted their Eligibility Documents, Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal for the procurement of **Consulting Services for the Appraisal of BCDA Properties 2022** prior to the set deadline for submission on 22 August 2022 at 12:00 p.m., to wit:

- 1) Colliers International Philippines, Inc.
- 2) Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc.
- 3) Cuervo Appraisers, Inc.
- 4) Royal Asia Appraisal Corporation

WHEREAS, the submitted Eligibility Documents and Technical Proposal of the said bidders were opened by determining the presence or absence of the required documents using non-discretionary "pass/fail" criterion on 22 August 2022;

WHEREAS, the submitted Eligibility Documents and Technical Proposal of the said bidders were subjected to detailed evaluation and online validation on 25 August 2022;

WHEREAS, the Technical Working Group (TWG) of BAC-C deliberated the results of the evaluation of the Eligibility Documents and Technical Proposals on 26 August 2022. The said results show that the three (3) bidders were rated "Failed" due to their non-compliance with the requirements provided under the Eligibility Documents and Terms of Reference (TOR) for the project, and 2016 RIRR of R.A. 9184, to wit:

BAC-C Resolution: Procurement of Consulting Services for the Appraisal of BCDA Properties 2022
September 2022 / Version 1

Page 1 of 4

Bidders	NON-COMPLIANCE
Colliers International Philippines, Inc.	<p>a. Failed to submit a duly notarized Undertaking [Non-compliance with the forms required to be submitted specified on the Request for Proposals and Terms of Reference attached to Bid Bulletin No. 1, specifically Annex K - Duly notarized Undertaking specifying the names of the licensed appraisers, license numbers, and the validity of the licenses. Copies of the Professional Regulation Commission (PRC) licenses of the nominated Real Estate Appraisers should be attached to the notarized Undertaking]; and</p> <p>b. Failed to submit a duly notarized Bid Securing Declaration [Non-compliance with the forms required to be submitted specified on the Request for Proposals and Terms of Reference attached to Bid Bulletin No. 1, specifically Annex M - Bid Securing Declaration Form]</p>
Cuervo Appraisers, Inc.	Failed to submit at least 20 completed projects. Cuervo Appraisers only submitted <u>10 projects</u> . [Non-compliance with “minimum of <u>20 projects</u> worth Php 50,000 and above” required to be listed on Annex E: Curriculum Vitae of the Consultant (List of Similar Projects Undertaken within the period from 01 March 2016 to present (<u>minimum of 20 projects</u> worth Php 50,000 and above)]
Royal Asia Appraisal Corporation	Failed to meet the required number of Licensed Real Estate Appraisers. Royal Asia only nominated <u>three (3)</u> Licensed Real Estate Appraisers. [Non-compliance with the required <u>four (4)</u> Licensed Real Estate Appraisers as specified in the Request for Proposals and Terms of Reference attached to Bid Bulletin No. 1]

WHEREAS, the results of the evaluation of the Eligibility Documents and Technical Proposals likewise show that one (1) out of the four (4) bidders was rated “Passed” and garnered a total score of 91.60%, above the required minimum score of 70%, to wit:

Criteria	Weight	Passing Score	Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management Inc.
a) Applicable Work Experience of the Consultant	40%	28%	36.00%

b) Quality of personnel who shall be assigned to the project	50%	35%	47.60%
c) Plan of Approach and Project Methodology	10%	7%	8.00%
TOTAL	100%	70%	91.60%
REMARKS			PASSED

WHEREAS, consequent to the above results of the evaluation of the Eligibility Documents and Technical Proposal of Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc., the BAC-C issued a Notice of Eligibility dated 26 August 2022 declaring Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc. as the “Eligible” bidder to proceed for the Opening of Financial Proposal and Negotiation process;

WHEREAS, on 31 August 2022, the Financial Proposal of Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc. was opened and subjected to a preliminary examination by determining the presence or absence of the required document using a non-discretionary “pass/fail” criterion. Thereafter, the Financial Proposal of Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc. was evaluated and deliberated upon by the BAC-C. The table below shows the results of the said evaluation of the Financial Proposal:

BIDDER	ABC	FINANCIAL BID	VARIANCE
Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc.	Php 2,355,248.00	Php 2,045,760.00	Php 309,488.00 13.14%

WHEREAS, the BAC-C proceeded with the negotiations with Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc. wherein the latter agreed to the terms and conditions, and committed to its obligations set forth by BCDA in accordance with the TOR for the project and 2016 RIRR of RA 9184. A Notice of Post-Qualification on 31 August 2022 was issued immediately thereafter;

WHEREAS, on 01 September 2022, the TWG of BAC-C conducted a post-qualification activity to ascertain the authenticity of the documents submitted by Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc., and the results were presented to the BAC-C for deliberation on 05 September 2022;


NOW, THEREFORE, foregoing considered and after careful evaluation and thorough deliberation of the Eligibility Documents, Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal submitted for the **Consulting Services for the Appraisal of BCDA Properties 2022**, We,

the Members of the BAC-C, hereby RESOLVE as it is hereby RESOLVED to recommend the following:

1. To award the Contract for the **Consulting Services for the Appraisal of BCDA Properties 2022 (“Contract”)** to **Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc.**, as the bidder with the **Single Rated and Responsive Bid (SRRB)**, in the amount of **Pesos: Two Million Forty-Five Thousand Seven Hundred Sixty and 00/100 (Php 2,045,760.00), inclusive of applicable taxes, fees and incidental expenses**, pursuant to Sec. 53.6 of the 2016 RIRR of RA 9184;
2. To recommend to the Management the issuance of the corresponding Notice of Award (NOA) to **Cal-Fil Appraisal and Management, Inc.**, being the bidder with SRRB;
3. To direct the end-user to facilitate the signing of the Contract and the issuance of the Notice to Proceed; and
4. To require the end-user to provide the BAC-C Secretariat copies of the duly conformed NOA, as well as the executed Contract and all supporting documents pursuant to this procurement.

RESOLVED, at the BCDA Corporate Center Office this 5th day of September 2022.

BIDS AND AWARDS COMMITTEE FOR CONSULTING SERVICES (BAC-C)


ARREY A. PEREZ
Chairperson


ATTY. FERNANDO T. GALLARDO, JR.
Vice Chairperson


VIRGIL M. ALVAREZ
Member


MARIA JOSEFINA V. PE
Member


RICHARD BRIAN M. CEPE
Member

Approved by:


ATTY. GISELA Z. KALALO
OIC, Office of the Executive Vice President